

Review

The Role of Proteases in Determining Stomatal Development and Tuning Pore Aperture: A Review

Dimitrios Fanourakis ^{1,2}, Nikolaos Nikoloudakis ³, Polyxeni Pappi ⁴, Emmanouil Markakis ⁴, Georgios Doupis ⁴, Spyridoula N. Charova ^{5,6}, Costas Delis ⁷ and Georgios Tsaniklidis ^{4,*}

- ¹ Department of Agriculture, School of Agricultural Sciences, Hellenic Mediterranean University, Estavromenos, Heraklion, 71500 Crete, Greece; dimitrios.fanourakis82@gmail.com
- ² Giannakakis SA, Export Fruits and Vegetables, Tympaki, 70200 Crete, Greece
- ³ Department of Agricultural Sciences, Biotechnology and Food Science, Cyprus University of Technology, 3036 Limassol, Cyprus; n.nikoloudakis@cut.ac.cy
- ⁴ Hellenic Agricultural Organization—'Demeter', Institute of Olive Tree, Subtropical Crops and Viticulture, Heraklion, 71307 Crete, Greece; polyxeni.pappi@nagref-her.gr (P.P.); markakis@nagref-her.gr (E.M.); gdoupis@gmail.com (G.D.)
- ⁵ Institute of Molecular Biology and Biotechnology, Foundation for Research and Development, Heraklion, 70013 Crete, Greece; charova@imbb.forth.gr
- ⁶ Department of Biology, University of Crete, Heraklion, 70013 Crete, Greece
- ⁷ Department of Agriculture, University of the Peloponnese, 24100 Kalamata, Greece; delis@us.uop.gr
- * Correspondence: tsaniklidis@nagref-her.gr; Tel.: +30-2810-302-300

Received: 7 February 2020; Accepted: 6 March 2020; Published: 8 March 2020



Abstract: Plant proteases, the proteolytic enzymes that catalyze protein breakdown and recycling, play an essential role in a variety of biological processes including stomatal development and distribution, as well as, systemic stress responses. In this review, we summarize what is known about the participation of proteases in both stomatal organogenesis and on the stomatal pore aperture tuning, with particular emphasis on their involvement in numerous signaling pathways triggered by abiotic and biotic stressors. There is a compelling body of evidence demonstrating that several proteases are directly or indirectly implicated in the process of stomatal development, affecting stomatal index, density, spacing, as well as, size. In addition, proteases are reported to be involved in a transient adjustment of stomatal aperture, thus orchestrating gas exchange. Consequently, the proteases-mediated regulation of stomatal movements considerably affects plants' ability to cope not only with abiotic stressors, but also to perceive and respond to biotic stimuli. Even though the determining role of proteases on stomatal development and functioning is just beginning to unfold, our understanding of the underlying processes and cellular mechanisms still remains far from being completed.

Keywords: pore aperture; stomata; stomatal length; stomatal density; stomatal spacing; transpiration; water loss

1. Introduction

In all living cells, the breakdown of functional proteins, as well as, the recycling of non-functional, misfolded or obsolete polypeptides to amino acids, are fundamental regulatory physiological and developmental processes, involving a diverse array of enzymes. These enzymes either selectively terminate proteins or generate biologically active peptides via cleavage. It is well known that this fundamental decomposition of proteins is carried out via either the ubiquitin/proteasome pathway or by inducing selective irreversible post-translational modifications, which in turn hamper protein

functionality [1–4]. Proteolytic enzymes also participate in signaling pathways, which mediate diverse biological functions such as programmed cell death, as well as, plant responses to both biotic and abiotic stressors [4–7].

Plant genomes encode numerous proteases (also known as peptidases or proteolytic enzymes) that are structurally diverse enzymes despite having a common substrate-activity; namely they catalyze the hydrolytic cleavage of peptide bonds between peptide residues. After the initiation of the proteolytic mechanism, this process is mainly regulated by protease inhibitors [8]. Plant proteases are classified according to the MEROPS database (http://merops.sanger.ac.uk) in nine groups (the five major groups; serine, cysteine, aspartic, threonine, metalloproteases, as well as asparagine, glutamic, mixed and proteases with unknown catalytic type), based on the nature of the functional group of active sites that performs the (usually) selective hydrolysis of the peptide bonds [8–10].

In higher plants, leaf gas fluxes primarily take place through stomata, which are actively regulated pores on the leaf surface [11–13]. The starting point of stomatal development is the protodermal stem cells which are differentiated in succession to Meristemoid Mother cells (MMC), Meristemoids, Guard Mother Cells (GMCs) and finally to Guard Cells (GC). This process is driven by three closely related transcription factors (SPEECHLESS (SPCH), MUTE and FAMA). The regulation of the SPCH, MUTE and FAMA mechanism is achieved with an array of other proteins and transcriptional factors exhibiting complex interactions allowing for its fine tuning according to the external stimuli. Indeed, hormonal and environmental signals are proven to affect this process by targeting specific of the plethora of regulators that affect the SPCH, MUTE and FAMA mechanism [14–16] (Figure 1).



Figure 1. The main stomatal developmental pathway. The experimentally confirmed steps are shown as solid lines, and the steps that are yet unverified are shown as non-colored dotted lines. An arrow indicates a positive regulation, while a 'T' indicates negative regulation. Dark blue bubbles indicate critical controllers of the stomatal development, light blue bubbles indicate secondary regulators of the pathway, yellow bubbles mark the proteases that are involved in the pathway. Additional abbreviations: SCRM: Scream, YDA: YODA, MAPK: MAP Kinase, MAPKKK: MAPKK Kinase, SLGC: Stomatal lineage ground cell, FLP: Four Lips [16,17].

More specifically, a positive regulation towards the development of stomata has been confirmed for carbon dioxide, red light spectra, as well as the brassinosteroid signaling pathways. Furthermore, atmospheric air humidity and cold stress have also been implicated to control stomatal development and regulation [18].

Stomata play an essential role in the intake of CO_2 for photosynthesis, and at the same time regulate transpirational water loss. A smaller portion of leaf gas fluxes occurs via the cuticle (passive regulation), a

aperture tuning.

process that becomes increasingly important upon unfavorable (stress) conditions [19–21]. The stomatal cross-sectional area, where gas exchange occurs, is set by both stomatal opening (pore aperture) and stomatal anatomical features (size, density and patterning (spacing)) [22–24]. Consequently, leaf diffusive conductance involves both long-term processes and short-term dynamics [25,26]. Long-term processes refer to the establishment of stomatal anatomical features, as well as, the formation of the cuticle during leaf expansion (weeks); hence cannot be readily reset following this period [22,24,26]. On the other hand, short-term dynamics are resolved by tunings in pore aperture (seconds to hours), and thus are reversible [27–29]. This review examines the involvement of specific classes of proteases in the regulatory and signaling pathways that govern stomatal development, as well as, stomatal pore

2. Subtilisin-Like Serine Proteases

Subtilisin-like proteases (subtilases) are mostly endopeptidases, containing a group of the amino acids aspartate (Asp), histidine (His), and serine (Ser) in their active site, and are effectively folded by forming a β -sheet secondary structure comprising of seven beta strands. Some subtilases have shown high substrate specificity, participating in phytohormone precursors' post-translational modification [30].

Three peptides have been shown to hold a predominant role in stomatal development (Epidermal Patterning Factor 1 (EPF1), Epidermal Patterning Factor 2 (EPF2), and Epidermal Patterning Factor Like 9 (EPFL9), also referred as STOM) [31,32]. EPF1 and EPF2 negatively regulate stomatal development by acting as ligands to activate the leucine-rich repeat receptor kinases (ER/LRR-RKs) [33], whereas, EPFL9 is a positive regulator, competing with EPF1 and EPF2 for LRR-RKs' binding [33]. *EPF1, EPF2,* and *EPFL9* are initially translated as pro-peptides, the full activation of which is achieved via protease cleaving. The proteases activating the EPF1, EPF2, and EPFL9 via posttranslational modification have not yet been successfully identified. To date, the following two subtilisin-like proteases have been implicated in the stomatal development: the Stomatal Density and Distribution 1 (SDD1) and the CO₂ Response Secreted Protease (CRSP or SBT5.2) [31].

The SDD1 gene encodes a 775–amino acid protein in Arabidopsis thaliana (L.) Heynh., which exhibits homology with the S8 subtilisin-like serine protease [34]. SDD1 gene expression is spatially and temporally limited to the stage of stomatal development in stomatal precursor cells. Transcripts were detected in meristemoids (stomatal initials) and GMCs, but were absent in mature stomata indicating a developmental rather than a constitutive role of SSD1 in stomatal formation [35]. In agreement to these results, Morales-Navarro et al. [36] reported increased transcription of the gene in growing tomato leaves suggesting the involvement of SDD1 in their development. SDD1 is a negative regulator of stomatal development, since it lessens both the formation of stomatal complexes and the number of stomata produced per stomatal complex [34]. Stomatal density was found to be higher (two to four-fold) in *sdd1–1* mutant as compared to the wild-type plants [33], whereas it was lower (two to three-fold) in the overexpressing lines [35]. A decrease in stomatal density, as a result of SDD1 overexpression, has been generally correlated to enhanced water use efficiency and drought tolerance [37,38]. Moreover, SDD1 regulates the orientation of spacing divisions in neighboring cells [36]. In *sdd1–1* mutants, the principle of maintaining one epidermal cell spacing between adjacent stomata was violated, as a result of misoriented spacing divisions, thus forming stomatal clusters (i.e., two or more stomata touching) [34]. This contact between neighboring stomata has been related to pitfalls, including reduced carbon assimilation and impaired stomatal responses to external cues [22]. Moreover, similar functionality of SDD1 has been reported in *Arabidopsis* and tomato by Morales-Navarro et al. [36]. Although SDD1 strongly influences stomatal development, the proteolysis of EPF members by the SDD1 remains elusive [31,39].

The CRSP is another subtilisin-like protease involved in the control of stomatal development [40,41]. CRSP negatively regulates stomatal development under high CO₂ concentration by processing the EPF2 precursor [39]. This processing results to blockage of the asymmetric divisions of the MMCs [42].

Wild-type *Arabidopsis thaliana* plants and the majority of plant species typically undergo a repression in stomatal development under elevated CO_2 [41]. However, this response is disrupted in *crsp* mutants, which exhibit an inverted developmental response, namely producing more stomata at high CO_2 levels [40]. EPF2 negatively regulates stomatal development [30]. Although CRSP has been shown to cleave EPF2, the effect of this cleavage on the interaction between EPF2 and LRR-RK remains unknown [40,41].

Senescence-Associated Subtilisin Protease (SASP) is another serine protease. It was recently demonstrated that apart from an elemental role in senescence, SASP is a key component in abscisic acid (ABA) signaling and drought tolerance. Indeed, SASP disintegrates Open Stomata 1 (OST1), an ABA signaling regulator, and in this way making stomata insensitive to ABA. Knocking down the *SASP* gene resulted to increased drought tolerance, since the stomatal response to stress-induced ABA was amplified [43,44].

3. Vacuolar Processing Enzymes (Cysteine Proteinases)

According to MEROPS nomenclature, there are 63 subfamilies of cysteine proteinases that are subdivided into six groups (C, CA, CD, CE, CF and CH), making them one of the largest and most widely represented plant proteinase classes. Vacuolar processing enzymes (VPEs) are vacuolar localized cysteine proteinases that have been reported to hold multiple and important attributes in plant development, most notably regulating the mobilization of storage proteins in seeds. Moreover, VPEs possess critical roles in plant defense, as they are known to be involved in the process of programmed cell death under viral infection and hypersensitive responses. Recently, the VPEs' role in the control of stomatal pore aperture during both pathogen attack and under abiotic stress (drought, salinity, low or high temperature) has been deciphered [45–48].

Arabidopsis γ -vpe mutant lines exhibited a drought tolerant phenotype. In this regard, it is interesting to note that γ -vpe knock-out mutants had a reduced stomatal opening, suggesting that this type of VPE is implicated in stomatal pore aperture regulation [49]. In rice, it was shown that the suppression of *OsVPE3* enhances salt tolerance by reducing vacuole rupture during programmed cell death, as well as by decreasing both leaf width and stomatal GC length [50]. Stomatal closure can be triggered by pathogens, pathogen-associated molecular patterns (PAMPs), and elicitors. VPEs are possibly involved in the control of the elicitor-induced stomatal closure by regulating NO accumulation in GCs [51], and thereby playing a key role in plant immunity.

Moreover, the suppression of *VPE3* led to reduced stomatal length in rice [50]. This effect was related to the downregulation of the expression levels of genes related to the stomatal development, namely: *Too Many Mouths (TMM), Speechless (SPCH1)* and *Mute* [50]. Although this study clearly establishes a role of proteinases on determining stomatal length, the processes underlying this effect remain to be elucidated.

Similarly, improved drought tolerance, owing to an enhanced control of water loss via stomata and increased ABA sensitivity, has also been reported following transgenic overexpression of *CYS4* (coding for a cysteine proteinase inhibitor) that targets both VPEs and Papain-like cysteine proteases in *Arabidopsis thaliana* and *Malus domestica* Borkh [52].

The direct inhibition of protease activity is expected to underlie these effects. Moreover, stomatal closure following elicitor inoculation was significantly inhibited by *VPE* silencing in *Nicotiana benthamiana* Domin [53]. The elicitor-triggered NO accumulation in GCs was also suppressed by VPE deficiency [46]. Taken together available data, suggests that VPE mediates the elicitor-induced stomatal closure by controlling the NO accumulation in GCs [46,51].

It appears that stomatal closure during the infection with various pathogens is a complicated cascade regulated by VPEs' activity, which is influenced by NO signaling and can be triggered by PAMPs. Thus, it is suggested that VPEs possess a pivotal and multifunctional regulatory role in the initial defensive physiological reactions against pathogens [6,48,53].

4. Papain-Like Cysteine Proteases

Papain-like cysteine proteases (PLCPs), featuring a nucleophilic cysteine thiol at the active site, are coded by a multigene family (with at least 31 members in *Arabidopsis*). These genes contribute to a plethora of physiological procedures, such as seed germination, anther development, programmed cell death, senescence, abiotic stress responses and plant innate immunity system [54]. In the apoplast, the vast majority of proteases, recognizing different pathogen types and transmitting the respective messages, belongs to PLCPs. However, different PLCPs enable separate signaling pathways initiating the appropriate innate immunity response [6].

Further evidence on the role of proteases in stomatal regulation and development comes from recent work in barley [55]. Knock-down lines with reduced transcription of two Papain-like cysteine protease genes (*PAP-1* and *PAP-19*), exhibited differential stomatal development and functionality as compared to wild-type plants. Even though both *pap-1* and *pap-19* knock-down lines exhibited a decrease of stomatal pore area, still, only the stomatal pore of *pap-19* plants was significantly larger than the wild-type. According to the same report, *pap-1* and *pap-19* lines differentially responded to biotic stimuli. Moreover, the phytohormonic equilibrium (especially jasmonic acid levels) under drought stress was different between knock-down lines and wild-type plants, thus suggesting that a delicate crosstalk among phytohormones, proteases and stomatal regulation occurs under stress.

A large number of pathogens uses stomatal pores as an entrance in order to colonize inner leaf tissues. For instance, several pathogens such as *Plasmopara viticola* and *Puccinia* Pers. fungal species [56–58] specifically internalize leaves only through stomata. In addition, stomatal pores can also serve as the occasional entrance for many other pathogens, such as the bacteria *Xanthomonas campestris* pv armoraciae and *Pseudomonas syringae* [59]. While ABA appears to be a key regulator in stomatal closure, both salicylic acid (SA) and hydrogen peroxide, which are produced under several modes following pathogen attack and stress stimuli, are also involved. Indeed, SA and hydrogen peroxide have been both shown to halt pathogen penetration inside the plant body [59–61]. Recently, Ziemann et al. [62] reported that through the activity of a Papain-like cysteine protease, the immune signaling peptide 1 (ZIP1) is matured from its pro-peptide, and serves as an activator of SA signaling via transcriptional upregulation.

5. Aspartic Proteases

In *Arabidopsis thaliana*, an Aspartic protease (Aspartic Protease in Guard Cell 1; ASPG1) with a preferred localization in the stomatal GCs, has been implicated in ABA sensitivity acting competitively to the Small ubiquitin-like modifier (SUMO) proteases. The overexpression of ASPG1 gene resulted in faster stomatal closure under drought stress by enhancing the ABA sensitivity of GCs [63]. Correspondingly, another aspartic protease (APA1) has also been implicated in drought tolerance by exhibiting a similar activity to ASPG1. The overexpression of *APA1* gene resulted to increased drought tolerance, as plants exhibited reduced stomatal index and thus reduced water loss [64]. Moreover, Aspartic protease (AP17) has also been demonstrated to positively affect both ABA and antioxidant responses under stress, while it negatively affected stomatal pore aperture in grape vine [65]. In addition, the aspartic protease Constitutive Disease Resistance 1 (CDR1) has a fundamental role in the initiation of SA-related signaling under pathogen attack that stimulates the innate immunity reactions [66]. While stomatal closure is one of the most characteristic innate immunity reactions, still the association between CDR1 activity and stomatal functionality is at the side of expectations, though this hypothesis remains to be experimentally addressed.

6. Ubiquitin-Mediated Proteasomal Protein Degradation and Ubiquitin-Like Modifiers

Ubiquitin-mediated proteasomal protein degradation is an important mechanism to control protein load in the cells. Ubiquitin, a regulatory protein that consists of 76 amino acids, binds to lysine residues of proteins, and usually promotes its degradation through the 26S proteasome complex

(a process known as "ubiquitination"). Abnormal, misfolded proteins, as well as, regulators of many processes are marked, and then degraded by the ubiquitin-proteasome system. This process allows cells to regulate the response to cellular level signals and altered environmental conditions [67]. The ubiquitin-mediated proteasomal degradation system has a key role in abiotic stress feedback, immunity, and hormonal signaling by interfering with key components of these pathways.

SPCH, MUTE, and FAMA transcription factors act in conjunction with several other proteins and transcription factors, orchestrating stomatal formation and differentiation [68]. This major regulatory system interacts with other transcription factors, such as the *Inducer of CBF Expression (ICE)*, during plant development with defined roles under specific environmental conditions [69]. Proteases' function also interplays with light spectra. Under dark, in the abaxial (lower) *Arabidopsis* epidermal cells, ICE is degraded by an E3 ubiquitin ligase (Constitutive Photomorphogenic 1-COP1), influencing stomatal development. Also, it was demonstrated that the activity of COP1 was suppressed by blue, red and far-red light. Moreover, COP1 interacts with phytochrome A, phytochrome B and cryptochrome 1, indicating that this system is fundamental for plant development in the ever-changing light environments [67,68]. Moreover, the involvement of another protease (E3 ubiquitin ligase-HOS1) in photoperiodic flowering and its similar mechanism of action in conjunction with phytochrome B, suggests that it can also be involved in stomatal development alongside to COP1 [70].

Additionally, the *ethylene response transcription factor* (*ERF*) family mediates a large number of plant developmental or stress-induced responses. It is documented that the NO sensing-induced stomatal closure, under specific environmental stimuli, is promoted by the degradation of a group of ERF factors. This degradation is achieved through the 26S proteasome and via the activity of a specialized E3 ubiquitin ligase [71,72].

The SUMO (small ubiquitin-like modifier) mechanism includes both specific SUMO ligases and SUMO proteases. Particularly, the SUMO procedure regulates the functionality of specific target proteins by attaching or cleaving ubiquitin-like polypeptides, and in this way regulates their activity, localization or integrity. The SUMO-tagging, however, is not employed for the protein proteasome disintegration, but only for the modification of the protein activity. Sumoylation appears to be a cornerstone regulatory mechanism for plant development and for the response to environmental stimuli [73,74].

In *Arabidopsis*, the silencing of two genes, coding for SUMO proteases (OTS1 and OTS2), resulted in increased stomatal pore aperture under decreased water potential, while notably leaf transpiration performance remained relatively unaffected. Moreover, ots1 and ots2 knocked-down lines that germinated in a medium containing 1 μ M ABA resulted in plants having larger stomatal pore size than wild-types [73]. In rice on the contrary, transgenic seedlings with altered levels of transcription (knocked-down or over-expressing) OTS1 SUMO protease did not exhibit differences in stomatal density. Still effects on the stomatal functionality were detected, since OTS1-overexpressing plants lost more water after a drought incident in comparison to wild-type and ots1-RNAi lines [75].

Recently, Orosa et al. [76] reported that the activity of a specific PAMP bacterial related sensor, Flagellin Sensing 2 (FLS2), is regulated by a class of SUMO proteases that target the receptor. FLS2 removes small ubiquitin-like SUMO chains, thus, adjusting the signal strength and consequently the immune response. Apart from the other immune responses triggered by the receptor, FLS2 also mediates the PAMP-associated stomatal closure. This is achieved even under high light levels that favor stomatal opening by inhibiting the influx K⁺ channels in the stomatal GCs with interrelation of ABA signaling [77,78]. Finally, it should be noted that several E3 ubiquitin ligases and F-Box proteins greatly influence stomatal functionality, especially under stress. However, since the activity of these enzymes differs from proteolysis [79,80], it falls out of the scope of this study.

7. Conclusions and Perspectives

Proteases selectively cleave proteins. Their involvement in controlling stomatal development and adjusting pore aperture is critically surveyed. Direct or indirect effects of proteases on stomatal index, density, spacing and size have been observed suggesting that proteolysis is a critical regulator of stomatal development. Moreover, several proteases have also been implicated to orchestrate the stomatal response to various biotic and abiotic stimuli. As stomata can be a critical entrance point for pathogens, while the precise regulation of stomatal functionality is fundamental for plant physiological adaptations under abiotic stress conditions, the alteration of stomatal activity exerts a large impact on plant ability to cope not only with abiotic, but also with biotic stressors. The determining role of proteases on several aspects of stomatal development and functioning has been established, though the underlying processes are still not fully deciphered. For example, the link between stomatal defense and the activity of metalloproteinases, especially of the apoplastic Matrix Metalloproteinases, which are known to participate in signaling and defense responses under pathogen attack, is to our knowledge yet undiscovered [81,82]. The emergence and use of powerful mutagenesis techniques, such as Clustered Regularly Interspaced Short Palindromic Repeats/CRISPR-associated endonuclease 9 (crispr/cas9), can generate an array of mutants in order to elucidate the mechanisms and the molecules participating into stomatal organogenesis and function. Moreover, transcriptional regulation of SPCH, MUTE and FAMA under diverse biotic or abiotic stresses could identify possible crosslinks of unidentified proteases regulating the development of stomata, and thus approaching a more complete picture of the underlying processes.

Author Contributions: D.F. and G.T. conceived the topic and drafted the manuscript. N.N., C.D., P.P., E.M., G.D. and S.N.C. edited the manuscript and provided valuable insights. All authors have read and agreed to the published version of the manuscript.

Funding: This research received no external funding.

Acknowledgments: Insightful discussions with Roland Pieruschka and Fabio Fiorani are greatly acknowledged.

Conflicts of Interest: The authors declare no conflict of interest.

Abbreviations

ABA, Absisic Acid; Asp, aspartate; ASPG1, ASPARTIC PROTEASE IN GUARD CELL 1; COP1, CONSTITUTIVE PHOTOMORPHOGENIC1; CDR1, Constitutive Disease Resistance 1; CRSP, CO₂ RESPONSE SECRETED PROTEASE (also referred as SBT5.2); EPF, EPIDERMAL PATTERNING FACTOR; EPF1, EPIDERMAL PATTERNING FACTOR 1; EPF2, EPIDERMAL PATTERNING FACTOR 2; EPFL9, EPIDERMAL PATTERNING FACTOR LIKE 9; ERF, ethylene response transcription factor; FLS2, Flagellin Sensing 2; GC, Guard Cells; GMC, Guard Mother Cells; His, histidine; ICE, Inducer of CBF Expression; LRR-RK, leucine-rich repeat receptor kinase; MMC, Meristemoid Mother cells; OSSPCH1, SPEECHLESS; OST1, Open Stomata 1; OSTMM, TOO MANY MOUTHS; PAMPs, pathogen-associated molecular patterns; PLCPs, Papain-like cysteine proteases; SA, Salicylic Acid; SASP, Senescence-Associated Subtilisin Protease; SDD1, STOMATAL DENSITY AND DISTRIBUTION 1; Ser, serine; SUMO, Small ubiquitin-like modifier; SPCH, SPEECHLESS; VPE, vacuolar processing enzyme.

References

- Palma, J.M.; Sandalio, L.M.; Corpas, F.J.; Romero-Puertas, M.C.; McCarthy, I.; del Rio, L.A. Plant proteases, protein degradation and oxidative stress: Role of peroxisomes. *Plant Physiol. Biochem.* 2002, 40, 521–530. [CrossRef]
- 2. Moon, J.; Parry, G.; Estelle, M. The ubiquitin-proteasome pathway and plant development. *Plant Cell* **2004**, *16*, 3181–3195. [CrossRef] [PubMed]
- 3. Schaller, A. A cut above the rest: The regulatory function of plant proteases. *Planta* **2004**, 220, 183–197. [CrossRef] [PubMed]
- 4. Thomas, E.L.; van der Hoorn, R.A. Ten prominent host proteases in plant-pathogen interactions. *Int. J. Mol. Sci.* **2018**, *19*, 639. [CrossRef] [PubMed]
- Salvesen, G.S.; Hempel, A.; Coll, N.S. Protease signaling in animal and plant regulated cell death. *FEBS J.* 2016, 283, 2577–2598. [CrossRef] [PubMed]
- Balakireva, A.V.; Zamyatnin, A.A. Indispensable role of proteases in plant innate immunity. *Int. J. Mol. Sci.* 2018, 19, 629. [CrossRef]
- 7. Moschou, P.N.; Gutierrez-Beltran, E.; Bozhkov, P.V.; Smertenko, A. Separase promotes microtubule polymerization by activating CENP-E-related Kinesin Kin7. *Dev. Cell* **2016**, *37*, 350–361. [CrossRef]

- Stael, S.; Van Breusegem, F.K.; Gevaert Nowack, M.K. Plant proteases and programmed cell death. *J. Exp. Bot.* 2019, 70, 1991–1995. [CrossRef]
- 9. Rao, M.; Tankasale, A.; Ghatge, M.; Desphande, V. Molecular and biotechnological aspects of microbial proteases. *Microbiol. Mol. Biol. Rev.* **1998**, *62*, 597–634. [CrossRef]
- 10. Rawlings, N.D.; Morton, F.R.; Barrett, A.J. MEROPS: The peptidase database. *Nucleic Acids Res.* **2006**, *34*, D270–D272. [CrossRef]
- Giday, H.; Fanourakis, D.; Kjaer, K.H.; Fomsgaard, I.S.; Ottosen, C.O. Foliar abscisic acid content underlies genotypic variation in stomatal responsiveness after growth at high relative air humidity. *Ann. Bot.* 2013, 112, 1857–1867. [CrossRef] [PubMed]
- 12. Fanourakis, D.; Giday, H.; Hyldgaard, B.; Bouranis, D.; Körner, O.; Ottosen, C.O. Low air humidity during growth promotes stomatal closure ability in roses. *Eur. J. Hortic. Sci.* **2019**, *84*, 245–252. [CrossRef]
- Carvalho, D.R.A.; Koning-Boucoiran, C.F.S.; Fanourakis, D.; Vasconcelos, M.W.; Carvalho, S.M.P.; Heuvelink, E.; Krens, F.A.; Maliepaard, C. QTL analysis for stomatal functioning in tetraploid *Rosa × hybrida*grown at high relative air humidity and its implications on postharvest longevity. *Mol. Breed.* 2015, *35*, 172. [CrossRef]
- 14. Ortega, A.; de Marcos, A.; Illescas-Miranda, J.; Mena, M.; Fenoll, C. The tomato genome encodes SPCH, MUTE, and FAMA candidates that can replace the endogenous functions of their Arabidopsis orthologs. *Front. Plant Sci.* **2019**, *10*, 300. [CrossRef]
- 15. Chater, C.C.C.; Caine, R.S.; Fleming, A.J.; Gray, J.E. Origins and evolution of stomatal development. *Plant Physiol.* **2017**, *174*, 624–638. [CrossRef]
- Qi, X.; Torii, K.U. Hormonal and environmental signals guiding stomatal development. *BMC Biol.* 2018, 16, 21. [CrossRef]
- 17. Lau, O.S.; Bergmann, D.C. Stomatal development: A plant's perspective on cell polarity, cell fate transitions and intercellular communication. *Development* **2012**, *139*, 3683–3692. [CrossRef]
- 18. Pillitteri, L.J.; Dong, J. Stomatal development in Arabidopsis. Arab. Book 2013, 11, e0162. [CrossRef]
- 19. Boyer, J.S.; Wong, S.C.; Farquhar, C.D. CO₂, and water vapor exchange across leaf cuticle (epidermis) at various water potentials. *Plant Physiol.* **1997**, *114*, 185–191. [CrossRef]
- Fanourakis, D.; Heuvelink, E.; Carvalho, S.M.P. A comprehensive analysis of the physiological and anatomical components involved in higher water loss rates after leaf development at high humidity. *J. Plant Physiol.* 2013, 170, 890–898. [CrossRef]
- 21. Fanourakis, D.; Hyldgaard, B.; Giday, H.; Aulik, I.; Bouranis, D.; Körner, O.; Ottosen, C.O. Stomatal anatomy and closing ability is affected by supplementary light intensity in rose (*Rosa hybrida* L.). *Hort. Sci.* **2019**, *46*, 81–89. [CrossRef]
- 22. Dow, G.J.; Berry, J.A.; Bergmann, D.C. The physiological importance of developmental mechanisms that enforce proper stomatal spacing in *Arabidopsis thaliana*. *New Phytol.* **2014**, 201, 1205–1217. [CrossRef] [PubMed]
- 23. Fanourakis, D.; Giday, H.; Milla, R.; Pieruschka, R.; Kjaer, K.H.; Bolger, M.; Vasilevski, A.; Nunes-Nesi, A.; Fiorani, F.; Ottosen, C.O. Pore size regulates operating stomatal conductance, while stomatal densities drive the partitioning of conductance among leaf sides. *Ann. Bot.* **2015**, *115*, 555–565. [CrossRef] [PubMed]
- 24. Fanourakis, D.; Heuvelink, E.; Carvalho, S.M.P. Spatial heterogeneity in stomatal features during leaf elongation: An analysis using *Rosa hybrida*. *Funct. Plant Biol.* **2015**, *42*, 737–745. [CrossRef]
- 25. Giday, H.; Fanourakis, D.; Kjaer, K.H.; Fomsgaard, I.S.; Ottosen, C.O. Threshold response of stomatal closing ability to leaf abscisic acid concentration during growth. *J. Exp. Bot.* **2014**, *65*, 4361–4370. [CrossRef]
- 26. Fanourakis, D.; Bouranis, D.; Giday, H.; Carvalho, D.R.A.; Rezaei Nejad, A.; Ottosen, C.O. Improving stomatal functioning at elevated growth air humidity: A review. *J. Plant Physiol.* **2016**, 207, 51–60. [CrossRef]
- 27. Fanourakis, D.; Hyldgaard, B.; Giday, H.; Bouranis, D.; Körner, O.; Nielsen, K.L.; Ottosen, C.O. Differential effects of elevated air humidity on stomatal closing ability of *Kalanchoë blossfeldiana* between the C₃ and CAM states. *Environ. Exp. Bot.* **2017**, *143*, 115–124. [CrossRef]
- Carvalho, D.R.A.; Fanourakis, D.; Correia, M.J.; Monteiro, J.A.; Araújo-Alves, J.P.L.; Vasconcelos, M.W.; Almeida, D.P.F.; Heuvelink, E.; Carvalho, S.M.P. Root-to-shoot ABA signaling does not contribute to genotypic variation in stomatal functioning induced by high relative air humidity. *Environ. Exp. Bot.* 2016, 123, 13–21. [CrossRef]

- 29. Sellin, A.; Niglas, A.; Õunapuu-Pikas, E.; Kupper, P. Rapid and long-term effects of water deficit on gas exchange and hydraulic conductance of silver birch trees grown under varying atmospheric humidity. *BMC Plant Biol.* **2014**, *14*, 72. [CrossRef]
- van der Hoorn, R.A.L. Plant proteases: From phenotypes to molecular mechanisms. *Annu. Rev. Plant Biol.* 2008, 59, 191–223. [CrossRef]
- Zoulias, N.; Harrison, E.L.; Casson, S.A.; Gray, J.E. Molecular control of stomatal development. *Biochem. J.* 2018, 475, 441. [CrossRef] [PubMed]
- 32. Katsir, L.; Davies, K.A.; Bergmann, D.C.; Laux, T. Peptide signaling in plant development. *Curr. Biol.* 2011, 21, 356–364. [CrossRef] [PubMed]
- Shimada, T.; Sugano, S.S.; Hara-Nishimura, I. Positive and negative peptide signals control stomatal density. *Cell. Mol. Life Sci.* 2011, *68*, 2081–2088. [CrossRef] [PubMed]
- 34. Berger, D.; Altmann, T. A subtilisin-like serine protease involved in the regulation of stomatal density and distribution in *Arabidopsis thaliana*. *Genes Dev.* **2000**, *14*, 1119–1131. [PubMed]
- 35. Von Groll, U.; Berger, D.; Altmann, T. The subtilisin-like serine protease SDD1 mediates cell-to-cell signaling during *Arabidopsis* stomatal development. *Plant Cell* **2002**, *14*, 1527–1539. [CrossRef] [PubMed]
- 36. Morales-Navarro, S.; Perez-Diaz, R.; Ortega, A.; de Marcos, A.; Mena, M.; Fenoll, C.; Gonzalez-Villanueva, E.; Ruiz-Lara, S. Overexpression of a SDD1-Like gene from wild tomato decreases stomatal density and enhances dehydration avoidance in Arabidopsis and cultivated tomato. *Front. Plant Sci.* 2018, 9, 940. [CrossRef] [PubMed]
- Yoo, C.Y.; Pence, H.E.; Jin, J.B.; Miura, K.; Gosney, M.J.; Hasegawa, P.M.; Mickelbart, M.V. The *Arabidopsis* GTL1 transcription factor regulates water use efficiency and drought tolerance by modulating stomatal density via transrepression of SDD1. *Plant Cell* 2010, *22*, 4128–4141. [CrossRef]
- Liu, Y.; Qin, L.; Han, L.; Xiang, Y.; Zhao, D. Overexpression of maize SDD1 (ZmSDD1) improves drought resistance in *Zea mays* L. by reducing stomatal density. *Plant Cell Tissue Organ Cult.* 2015, 122, 147–159. [CrossRef]
- 39. Hunt, L.; Gray, J.E. The signaling peptide EPF2 controls asymmetric cell divisions during stomatal development. *Curr. Biol.* **2009**, *19*, 864–869. [CrossRef]
- 40. Engineer, C.B.; Ghassemian, M.; Anderson, J.C.; Peck, S.C.; Hu, H.; Schroeder, J.I. Carbonic anhydrases, EPF2 and a novel protease mediate CO2 control of stomatal development. *Nature* **2014**, *513*, 246–250. [CrossRef]
- Engineer, C.B.; Hashimoto-Sugimoto, M.; Negi, J.; Israelsson-Nordström, M.; Azoulay-Shemer, T.; Rappel, W.J.; Iba, K.; Schroeder, J.I. CO₂ sensing and CO₂ regulation of stomatal conductance: Advances and open questions. *Trends Plant Sci.* 2016, 21, 16–30. [CrossRef] [PubMed]
- 42. Liu, C.; Moschou, P.N. Cutting in the middleman: Hidden substrates at the interface between proteases and plant development. *New Phytol.* **2017**, *218*, 916–922. [CrossRef] [PubMed]
- 43. Acharya, B.R.; Jeon, B.W.; Zhang, W.; Assmann, S.M. Open Stomata 1 (OST1) is limiting in abscisic acid responses of Arabidopsis guard cells. *New Phytol.* **2013**, 200, 1049–1063. [CrossRef] [PubMed]
- 44. Wang, Q.; Guo, Q.; Guo, Y.; Yang, J.; Wang, M.; Duan, X.; Niu, J.; Liu, S.; Zhang, J.; Lu, Y.; et al. Arabidopsis subtilase SASP is involved in the regulation of ABA signaling and drought tolerance by interacting with OPEN STOMATA 1. *J. Exp. Bot.* **2018**, *69*, 4403–4417. [CrossRef] [PubMed]
- 45. Grudkowska, M.; Zagdanska, B. Multifunctional role of plant cysteine proteinases. *Acta Biochim. Pol.* **2004**, 51, 609–624. [CrossRef] [PubMed]
- 46. Zhang, H.J.; Dong, S.M.; Wang, M.F.; Wang, W.; Song, W.W.; Dou, X.Y.; Zheng, X.; Zhang, Z. The role of vacuolar processing enzyme (VPE) from *Nicotiana benthamiana* in elicitor-triggered hypersensitive response and stomatal closure. *J. Exp Bot.* **2010**, *61*, 3799–3812. [CrossRef]
- 47. Hatsugai, N.; Yamada, K.; Goto-Yamada, S.; Hara-Nishimura, I. Vacuolar processing enzyme in plant programmed cell death. *Front. Plant Sci.* **2015**, *6*, 234. [CrossRef]
- 48. Vorster, B.J.; Cullis, C.A.; Kunert, K.J. Plant Vacuolar Processing Enzymes. *Front. Plant Sci.* **2019**, *10*, 479. [CrossRef]
- Albertini, A.; Simeoni, F.; Galbiati, M.; Bauer, H.; Tonelli, C.; Cominelli, E. Involvement of the vacuolar processing enzyme γVPE in response of *Arabidopsis thaliana* to water stress. *Biol. Plant.* 2014, *58*, 531–538. [CrossRef]

- 50. Lu, W.; Deng, M.; Guo, F.; Wang, M.; Zeng, Z.; Han, N.; Yang, Y.; Zhu, M.; Bian, H. Suppression of OsVPE3 enhances salt tolerance by attenuating vacuole rupture during programmed cell death and affects stomata development in rice. *Rice* **2016**, *9*, 65. [CrossRef]
- Zhang, H.; Zheng, X.; Zhang, Z. The role of vacuolar processing enzymes in plant immunity. *Plant Signal. Behav.* 2010, 5, 1565–1567. [CrossRef] [PubMed]
- 52. Tan, Y.; Li, M.; Yang, Y.; Sun, X.; Wang, N.; Liang, B.; Ma, F. Overexpression of MpCYS4, a phytocystatin gene from *Malus prunifolia* (Willd.) Borkh. enhances stomatal closure to confer drought tolerance in transgenic Arabidopsis and apple. *Front. Plant Sci.* **2017**, *8*, 33. [CrossRef] [PubMed]
- 53. Zhang, J.; Zhou, J.M. Plant immunity triggered by microbial molecular signatures. *Mol. Plant.* **2010**, *3*, 783–793. [CrossRef] [PubMed]
- 54. Liu, H.J.; Hu, M.H.; Wang, Q.; Cheng, L.; Zhang, Z.B. Role of papain-like cysteine proteases in plant development. *Front. Plant Sci.* 2018, *9*, 1717. [CrossRef] [PubMed]
- 55. Gomez-Sanchez, A.; Gonzalez-Melendi, P.; Estrella Santamaria, M.; Arbona, V.; Lopez-Gonzalvez, A.; Garcia, A.; Hensel, G.; Kumlehn, J.; Martinez, M.; Diaz, I. Repression of drought-induced cysteine-protease genes alters barley leaf structure and responses to abiotic and biotic stresses. *J. Exp. Bot.* 2019, 70, 2143–2155. [CrossRef] [PubMed]
- 56. Allègre, M.; Daire, X.; Heloir, M.C.; Trouvelot, S.; Mercier, L.; Adrian, M.; Pugin, A. Stomatal deregulation in *Plasmopara viticola*-infected grapevine leaves. *New Phytol.* **2007**, *173*, 832–840. [CrossRef] [PubMed]
- 57. Shafiei, R.; Hang, C.; Kang, J.G.; Loake, G.J. Identification of loci controlling non-host disease resistance in Arabidopsis against the leaf rust pathogen *Puccinia triticina*. *Mol. Plant Pathol.* **2007**, *8*, 773–784. [CrossRef]
- 58. Grimmer, M.K.; John Foulkes, M.; Paveley, N.D. Foliar pathogenesis and plant water relations: A review. *J. Exp. Bot.* **2012**, *63*, 4321–4331. [CrossRef]
- 59. Melotto, M.; Underwood, W.; Koczan, J.; Nomura, K.; He, S.Y. Plant stomata function in innate immunity against bacterial invasion. *Cell* **2006**, *126*, 969–980. [CrossRef]
- Paschalidis, K.; Tsaniklidis, G.; Wang, B.; Delis, C.; Trantas, E.; Loulakakis, K.; Makky, M.; Sarris, P.F.; Ververidis, F.; Liu, J. The interplay among polyamines and nitrogen in plant stress responses. *Plants* 2019, *8*, 315. [CrossRef]
- 61. Tsaniklidis, G.; Pappi, P.; Tsafouros, A.; Charova, S.N.; Nikoloudakis, N.; Roussos, P.A.; Paschalidis, K.A.; Delis, C. Polyamine Homeostasis in Tomato Biotic/Abiotic Stress Cross-Tolerance. *Gene* **2020**, 727, 144230. [CrossRef] [PubMed]
- Ziemann, S.; Van Der Linde, K.; Lahrmann, U.; Acar, B.; Kaschani, F.; Colby, T.; Kaiser, M.; Ding, Y.; Schmelz, E.; Huffaker, A.; et al. An apoplastic peptide activates salicylic acid signaling in maize. *Nat. Plants* 2018, 4, 172–180. [CrossRef] [PubMed]
- 63. Yao, X.; Xiong, W.; Ye, T.; Wu, Y. Overexpression of the aspartic protease ASPG1 gene confers drought avoidance in Arabidopsis. *J. Exp. Bot.* **2012**, *63*, 2579–2593. [CrossRef] [PubMed]
- 64. Sebastián, D.; Fernando, F.D.; Raúl, D.G.; Gabriela, G.M. Overexpression of Arabidopsis aspartic protease APA1 gene confers drought tolerance. *Plant Sci.* **2020**. [CrossRef]
- 65. Guo, R.; Zhao, J.; Wang, X.; Guo, C.; Li, Z.; Wang, Y.; Wang, X. Constitutive expression of a grape aspartic protease gene in transgenic Arabidopsis confers osmotic stress tolerance. *Plant Cell Tissue Org.* **2015**, 121, 275–287. [CrossRef]
- 66. Xia, Y.; Suzuki, H.; Borevitz, J.; Blount, J.; Guo, Z.; Patel, K.; Dixon, R.A.; Lamb, C. An extracellular aspartic protease functions in Arabidopsis disease resistance signaling. *EMBO J.* **2004**, *23*, 980–988. [CrossRef]
- 67. Sharma, B.; Joshi, D.; Yadav, P.K.; Gupta, A.K.; Bhatt, T.K. Role of Ubiquitin-Mediated Degradation System in Plant Biology. *Front. Plant Sci.* **2016**, *7*, 806. [CrossRef]
- 68. Lee, J.H.; Jung, J.H.; Park, C.M. Light inhibits COP1-mediated degradation of ICE transcription factors to induce stomatal development in Arabidopsis. *Plant Cell* **2017**, *29*, 2817–2830. [CrossRef]
- 69. Jung, J.H.; Seo, P.J.; Park, C.M. The E3 ubiquitin ligase HOS1 regulates Arabidopsis flowering by mediating CONSTANS degradation under cold stress. *J. Biol. Chem.* **2012**, *287*, 43277–43287. [CrossRef]
- 70. Salomé, P.A. This ICE/SCRM Melts in the Dark: Light-Dependent COP1-Mediated Protein Degradation in Stomatal Formation. *Plant Cell* **2017**, *29*, 2680–2681. [CrossRef]
- 71. Gibbs, D.J.; Md Isa, N.; Movahedi, M.; Lozano-Juste, J.; Mendiondo, G.M.; Berckhan, S.; Marín-de la Rosa, N.; Vicente Conde, J.; Sousa Correia, C.; Pearce, S.P.; et al. Nitric oxide sensing in plants is mediated by proteolytic control of group VII ERF transcription factors. *Mol. Cell* **2014**, *53*, 369–379. [CrossRef] [PubMed]

- 72. Giuntoli, B.; Perata, P. Group VII ethylene response factors in Arabidopsis: Regulation and physiological roles. *Plant Physiol.* **2018**, *176*, 1143–1155. [CrossRef] [PubMed]
- 73. Castro, P.H.; Couto, D.; Freitas, S.; Verde, N.; Macho, A.P.; Huguet, S.; Botella, M.A.; Ruiz-Albert, J.; Tavares, R.M.; Bejarano, E.R.; et al. SUMO proteases ULP1c and ULP1d are required for development and osmotic stress responses in Arabidopsis thaliana. *Plant Mol. Biol.* **2016**, *92*, 143–159. [CrossRef] [PubMed]
- 74. Kurepa, J.; Walker, J.M.; Smalle, J.; Gosink, M.M.; Davis, S.J.; Durham, T.L.; Sung, D.Y.; Vierstra, R.D. The small ubiquitin-like modifier (SUMO) protein modification system in Arabidopsis. Accumulation of SUMO1 and -2 conjugates is increased by stress. *J. Biol. Chem.* **2003**, *278*, 6862–6872. [CrossRef]
- 75. Srivastava, A.K.; Zhang, C.; Caine, R.S.; Gray, J.; Sadanandom, A. Rice SUMO protease Overly Tolerant to Salt 1 targets the transcription factor, OsbZIP23 to promote drought tolerance in rice. *Plant J.* **2017**, *92*, 1031–1043. [CrossRef]
- 76. Orosa, B.; Yates, G.; Verma, V.; Srivastava, A.K.; Srivastava, M.; Campanaro, A.; de Vega, D.; Fernandes, A.; Zhang, C.; Lee, J.; et al. SUMO conjugation to the pattern recognition receptor FLS2 triggers intracellular signaling in plant innate immunity. *Nat. Commun.* 2018, *9*, 5185. [CrossRef]
- 77. Zhang, W.; He, S.Y.; Assmann, S.M. The plant innate immunity response in stomatal guard cells invokes G-protein-dependent ion channel regulation. *Plant J.* **2008**, *56*, 984–996. [CrossRef]
- Guzel Deger, A.; Scherzer, S.; Nuhkat, M.; Kedzierska, J.; Kollist, H.; Brosche, M.; Unyayar, S.; Boudsocq, M.; Hedrich, R.; Roelfsema, M.R.G. Guard cell SLAC1-type anion channels mediate flagellin-induced stomatal closure. *New Phytol.* 2015, 208, 162–173. [CrossRef]
- He, F.; Wang, H.L.; Li, H.G.; Su, Y.; Li, S.; Yang, Y.; Feng, C.H.; Yin, W.; Xia, X. PeCHYR1, a ubiquitin E3 ligase from *Populus euphratica*, enhances drought tolerance via ABA-induced stomatal closure by ROS production in Populus. *Plant Biotechnol. J.* 2018, *16*, 1514–1528. [CrossRef]
- An, J.; Li, Q.; Yang, J.; Zhang, G.; Zhao, Z.; Wu, Y.; Wang, Y.; Wang, W. Wheat F-box Protein TaFBA1 Positively Regulates Plant Drought Tolerance but Negatively Regulates Stomatal Closure. *Front. Plant Sci.* 2019, 10, 1242. [CrossRef]
- Melotto, M.; Zhang, L.; Oblessuc, P.R.; He, S.Y. Stomatal Defense a Decade Later. *Plant Physiol.* 2017, 174, 561–571. [CrossRef] [PubMed]
- Zhao, P.; Zhang, F.; Liu, D.; Imani, J.; Langen, G.; Kogel, K.H. Matrix metalloproteinases operate redundantly in Arabidopsis immunity against necrotrophic and biotrophic fungal pathogens. *PLoS ONE* 2017, 12, e0183577. [CrossRef] [PubMed]



© 2020 by the authors. Licensee MDPI, Basel, Switzerland. This article is an open access article distributed under the terms and conditions of the Creative Commons Attribution (CC BY) license (http://creativecommons.org/licenses/by/4.0/).